ASSESSMENT OF ENTREPRENEURSHIP EDUCATION IN TERTIARY INSTITUTIONS IN NIGERIA

Onumoh Ahmed Yahaya
onumoh2012@gmail.com

Abubakar B. Wali
abubakar323@gmail.com

Ahmed Halima Usman
halimaahmed08@gmail.com

AbdulsalamDauda
abdussalamdauda@yahoo.com

Karami Lauwali
karamilauwali@gmail.com

SCHOOL OF BUSINESS AND ENTREPRENEURSHIP EDUCATION
FEDERAL COLLEGE OF EDUCATION (TECHNICAL) GUSAU, ZAMFARA STATE

ABSTRACT

This study focused on the assessment of entrepreneurship education in tertiary institutions in Nigeria with particular reference to Federal College of Education (Technical) Gusau. The study considered all the schools under Federal College of Education (Technical) Gusau, Zamfara State. Out of the seven (7) schools, twenty-five students were selected from each school through simple random sampling as the sample size of the study. Primary data was employed in gathering data for the study through structured questionnaire. The data collected were analyzed through SPSS 16.0. The data were analyzed through the use of regression analysis and correlation. Entrepreneurship actions serve as dependent variables while the entrepreneurship education, teaching methods, educator’s competence, and entrepreneurship curriculum contents serve as independent variables. The result of the study shows that the entrepreneurship education and entrepreneurship curriculum content has a positive and significant influence on entrepreneurship actions while entrepreneurship education and teaching methods has no statistical significant influence on entrepreneurship actions. The study therefore recommends among other things that the stakeholders should ensure adequate entrepreneurship education in Nigeria tertiary institutions to inculcate entrepreneurship actions in graduates across Nigeria.

Key words: Educator’s Competence, Entrepreneurship Action, Entrepreneurship Curriculum, Entrepreneurship Education, Teaching Method
Introduction

The advent of outstanding entrepreneurs such as Aliko Dangote in Africa and Bill Gates in the U.S has motivated stakeholders, policy makers and researchers internationally to search for ways to model the younger generation after these are breeds of entrepreneurs in order to effectively tackle graduate unemployment and achieve economic development. The outcome is a focus on entrepreneurship education which is targeted at stimulating creative thinking and enhancing individuals to identify opportunities that can lead to business start-ups [1]. The introduction of entrepreneurship education by the Government in Nigeria tertiary institutions was one of the intervention strategies and policies in line with global trends to refocus tertiary education towards entrepreneurship growth as well as to battle the persistent rise in graduate unemployment. At present, entrepreneurship education in Nigerian tertiary institutions is offered as a compulsory general course. However, for any entrepreneurship education programme to realize its goals, the edifice and the key apparatuses of such programme must favourably influence students’ learning orientation and contemplations of entrepreneurship as a future career. The concern of learning orientation in the situation of entrepreneurship education in Nigerian universities has real implications considering that an individual’s learning orientation is not totally static particularly because it can be influenced based on definite situational contexts [2]. Specifically the design and process of an entrepreneurship programme offered in Nigerian tertiary institutions can facilitate undergraduates to be more learning oriented particularly if the design and process of such programmes are active experimentation oriented as well as encourage students to question their current knowledge [3].
However, an individual’s learning orientation displays the qualities of a personal trait, it is still considered as one that can be predisposed. Hence, a challenging entrepreneurship programme can improve students’ learning orientation. Entrepreneurship education in tertiary institutions has attracted the attention of researchers all over the world and one main research focus is students’ intentions for an entrepreneurial career. This is consequential upon the fact that intentions provide sufficient evidence of the result of an entrepreneurship training programme and because intentions are good predictors of future behaviour [4]. This suggests that intentions could provide a consistent lead to future entrepreneurial behaviour and expression of actions. However, entrepreneurial implementation intentions as theorised in this study recommend that intentions can be articulated through certain noticeable actions and behavioural responses to show commitment towards the achievement of entrepreneurial goals and ambitions. Nevertheless, perceptions play a perilous role in entrepreneurship education. If a student or an educator has a positive insight towards entrepreneurship education, it is likely that such an individual will keenly engage in the actions involved in the programme. Individuals with positive perception of an entrepreneurship programme will distinguish themselves as having what it takes to attain the goals of the programme as it relates to the teaching and learning outcomes [5]. Therefore the perception of a student or an educator about various aspects of an entrepreneurship programme will largely determine the goals the individual sets for him/herself and the expected outcome of actions taken. Therefore based on the perceptions of students and entrepreneurship educators in selected Nigerian tertiary institutions, this research explored the extent
to which exposure to assess the effect of entrepreneurship education at tertiary institutions in Nigeria.

Despite the introduction of entrepreneurship education as a compulsory course in Nigerian tertiary institutions, the aspirations for white collar jobs and graduate unemployment has persistently been on the increase. However, studies such as [6] have established that entrepreneurship education has a positive effect on entrepreneurial intentions of university students in Nigeria. Therefore, the development of entrepreneurial intentions by Nigerian tertiary institutions students may not be in doubt. Nevertheless, a serious task to explore in the Nigerian context is to survey the role of university support systems in motivating knowledge sharing and innovations among students.

The general objective of this study is to assess the effect of entrepreneurship education at tertiary institutions in Nigeria. More specifically, the study:

i) examined the effect of entrepreneurship education on entrepreneurship actions.

ii) assessed the effect of teaching methods in entrepreneurship on entrepreneurship actions.

iii) documented the effect of educator’s competence impacts on entrepreneurship actions.

iv) ascertained the effects of entrepreneurship curriculum contents on entrepreneurship actions.

The following Hypotheses were stated in null form were tested in this study;

$H_{01}$: there is no significant relationship between entrepreneurship education and entrepreneurship actions.

$H_{02}$: there is no significant relationship between teaching methods in entrepreneurship and entrepreneurship actions.
H_03: there is no significant relationship between educator’s competence and entrepreneurship actions.

H_04: there is no significant relationship between entrepreneurship curriculum contents and entrepreneurship actions.

**Concept of entrepreneurship education**

[5] defined entrepreneurship education as a combination of knowledge and skills, necessary for effectiveness in teaching entrepreneurship. In support of this, [7] described entrepreneurship education as a highly dynamic blend of theoretical understanding and relevant practical skill. They stressed that within a particular variety of procedures, diverse pedagogical approaches work differently, considering various groups of students, and peculiarity of the context. In the same vein, [8] stated that while representing the collective wisdom of culture, as well as upholding the value of disciplinary knowledge, entrepreneurship education must also be a critical and analytical regarding the capacities of students. In other words, it is safe to state that good entrepreneurship education specifically involves a broad collection of approaches and sustained responsiveness to what produces student learning. However, [9] posit that the pedagogical approach salient to entrepreneurship education is experiential education. This notion was supported by [10] who stated that experiential learning focuses on learning by doing; hence it is regarded as one of the best instructional techniques in entrepreneurship, because it offers students with opportunities to adopt material, and understand instructions given to them.

**Concept of teaching methods in entrepreneurship**

Teaching methods in entrepreneurship are an assortment of teaching practices that have a strong research base, that are clearly understood by classroom practitioners and
are direct responses to students’ needs and challenges. [11] declared that research has discharged these two myths as regards teaching; effective teaching springs from subject knowledge and mastery, and experienced teacher can teach or instruct on any subject. This was supported by [12] who argued that effective teaching is not just a function of subject mastery, but also the ability to identify the essential and relevant combination of knowledge and skills, essential for effective teaching. To this end [13] argued that methods of teaching such as class lectures, question and answer sessions and drills, are not adequate to facilitate the development of business ideas and similar entrepreneurial behaviour outcomes. This was supported by [14] who suggested that some of the most common and effective classifications of teaching methods in entrepreneurship include; group and individual research studies, invitation of guest speakers, role play, and simulations.

**Concept of educator’s competence**

Entrepreneurship educator competence is described by [8] as an integrated action based on skill and experience that allow individuals to perform adequately in teaching entrepreneurial related knowledge and competencies in learners. Entrepreneurship education is a decisive intervention by an educator in the life of the learner to impact entrepreneurial potentials and skills to enable the learner to survive in the world of business.

[15] defined an entrepreneurship educator as one who possesses vision, the ability to be both open and accommodating to new ideas, think laterally and critically about issues. According to [12], being entrepreneurial as a teacher means to be flexible and push the limits with respect to recognised criterions within entrepreneurship education.
Concept of entrepreneurship curriculum

[16] posited that as the literature on entrepreneurship education evolves, there has been a particular focus on what should be the content of the entrepreneurship curriculum, because researchers have argued that there is a fundamental disparity between entrepreneurship and business management. [17] argued that entrepreneurship education curriculum should contain entrepreneurial activities that motivate critical thinking in order to achieve teaching goals.

Entrepreneurship education and entrepreneurial actions

Entrepreneurship education should engage students in practical actions that motivate a shared vision and focus for identification of business opportunities. This is in line with the study of [18] that focused on how entrepreneurship educator-practitioners conceptualize and instruct the opportunity identification process. The results of the research showed that seventy five percent of the educators revealed that they anticipated that their students would figure out how to recognise potential business opportunities. The authors postulated that little is thought about whether and how opportunity identification is instructed in the entrepreneurship classroom. Similarly, [3] have a look at opportunity identification and its part in the entrepreneurial classroom. The aim of the study was to determine that opportunity identification is a competence that can be advanced in the classroom with the appropriate educational approach.

Teaching methods in entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial actions

The teaching methods engaged in entrepreneurship education should stimulate students’ interest in entrepreneurship and activities involving business start-ups. This was supported by the study of [2] that focused on the suitable teaching methods in entrepreneurship education by carrying out
two qualitative studies. The authors concluded that the appropriate teaching methods for teaching the course are group project, case study, individual project, development of a new business creation project and problem-solving. In the same vein, [14] examined the experiential entrepreneurship education approach highlighting the Start Your Own Business Assignment in the context of the entrepreneurship course offered to above 200 undergraduate students per year at the Haskayne School of Business, University of Calgary, Canada. The findings of the study suggests that experiential education in entrepreneurship courses, conveys both substantive, theoretical knowledge and intangible learning experiences best absorbed through active participation. The authors concluded that starting and operating a business is a unique, educational experience which allows students to apply the substantive knowledge gained in entrepreneurship courses to a real business. Similarly, [8] investigated the effectiveness of different teaching methods in entrepreneurship. The research focused on three learning design choices namely; experiential learning, use of teamwork and focus on quantitative methods. The paper examined teaching methods that could contribute to raising student scores on constructs of change, risk taking, goal setting, feedback and achievement as measured by a customized entrepreneurial propensity survey. The researchers asserted that experiential and practical oriented teaching methods motivate entrepreneurial goal setting.

**Entrepreneurship educator’s competence and entrepreneurial actions**

An entrepreneurship educator's competence can motivate students’ commitment to entrepreneurial related learning particularly as regards business plan writing. This was supported by the study of [4] who examined
the skill of entrepreneurship educators and appropriate teaching methods required for business planning competence of entrepreneurship graduate students. The research was based on an M.sc Entrepreneurship Management Course in three Universities of Tehran, Iran. The study adopted a qualitative approach using ten semi structured interviews on a sample of business plan experts and Entrepreneurship lecturers respectively. The results for the sample of experts showed that formal lectures, group project and simulation were effective teaching methods however, the results for the sample of lecturers showed that group study, case study, new venture creation project and problem solving approaches are considered appropriate. Nevertheless, the authors argued that students effectiveness in writing business plans can only be achieved based on the teacher’s skill and knowledge of teaching methods in entrepreneurship education.

Similarly, [14] investigated the present practice and comprehension of the teaching of the double weighted final year Business Plan module to undergraduate level for BA (Hons) in Business Studies students in Griffith College Dublin. The author focused on the teaching approach utilized on the course and analysed its viability. A qualitative approach was utilized which included the majority of the students, various supervisor, and the Business Plan Co-ordinator. The author posited that business planning in tertiary education is important and that business planning and entrepreneurship education should go hand in hand with a specific goal to encourage students to be more active in the full business cycle.

**Entrepreneurship curriculum and entrepreneurial actions**

The contents of an entrepreneurship curriculum should stimulate critical thinking in students and motivate generation of
feasible and viable business ideas. This was supported by the study of [19] who examined the development and assessment of two offerings of a sophomore-level engineering innovation and entrepreneurship boot camp. The both camp was based mainly on the development of entrepreneurial mind-set skills via the provision of curricular content on idea generation and the customer’s role in the design and technology transfer process. Results indicated that the bootcamp curricula can motivate learning of innovation and idea generation and lay the basic foundation for students’ skill sets that can be further developed within their academic careers.

In the same vein, [14] explored the inclination towards entrepreneurship among university students. The total population in this study was 181 and the respondents were selected by using simple random sampling. The findings of the research showed that the role of universities in promoting entrepreneurship, entrepreneurial curriculum and content and role models had significant impact on the inclination of the students towards entrepreneurship. In a similar study, [20] examined entrepreneurship training in the tertiary institutions and development of innovative business idea to the business venture start-up stage. The Business Team Project Partnership Program (BT-PPP) was identified as a strategic teaching curriculum for facilitating entrepreneurial idea generation. The study was based on a survey among the students of real estate students and facilities management students of UniversitiTun Hussein Onn Malaysia (UTHM), in 2012 business team projects partnership program. The result showed that BT-64 PPP passed the suitability fitness for motivating entrepreneurial idea generation, interaction and networking, as entrepreneurial learning outcomes.
Methodology
A descriptive research design was adopted for this study so as to obtain the opinion of students and educators on the extent to which participation in entrepreneurship education impacts on learning orientation. The study population consists of all NCE III students of all schools of Federal College of Education (Technical), Gusau, Zamfara state that offers entrepreneurship. Both Purposeful and simple random sampling technique were used to select the sample size of the study. Purposeful sampling technique was used to know the number to be selected from each school and simple random sampling was used to select 25 respondents from each school. Therefore, the total sample size was 175 students selected from the seven schools. Self-administered questionnaire was used to collect data from respondents. The questionnaire was anchored on 5 point Likert scale ranging from “5” strongly agree to “1” strongly disagree. Multiple regression analysis was used as a technique of data analysis to examine the effect of the relationship of each variable via SPSS 16.0. As a result, the following model is specified to effect of entrepreneurship education at tertiary institutions in Nigeria.

\[
enac = \beta_0 + \beta_1\text{ened} + \beta_2\text{teme} + \beta_3\text{edco} + \beta_4\text{ece} + \epsilon
\]

Where

- \(\beta_0\) = Intercept of the regression line
- \(\epsilon\) = represent the error term.
- \(\text{enac}\) = Entrepreneurship Actions
- \(\text{ened}\) = Entrepreneurship Education
- \(\text{teme}\) = Teaching Methods
- \(\text{edco}\) = Educator’s Competence
- \(\text{ece}\) = Entrepreneurship Curriculum Contents
**Data analyses and discussion**

The following table presents the descriptive statistics table where the mean, standard deviation, minimum and maximum of both independent variable and dependent variable were analyzed.

**Table 1: Descriptive Statistics**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Min</th>
<th>Max</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>enac</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.80</td>
<td>1.028</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ened</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.02</td>
<td>.947</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teme</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>4.01</td>
<td>1.072</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>edco</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.36</td>
<td>1.296</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ece</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>3.52</td>
<td>1.277</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: SPSS 16.0 Output, 2018

From table 1 documents that the responses on entrepreneurship actions (enac) range from 4 to 5. This indicates that the minimum response to the question is strongly disagreed while the maximum response is strongly agreed with the means score of 3.81. In addition, table 1 also documents that the responses on entrepreneurship education (ened), teaching methods (teme), educator’s competence (edco) and entrepreneurship curriculum contents (ece) range from 1 to 5. This indicates that the minimum response to the question strongly disagreed while the maximum response is strongly agreed with their means score of .947, 1.072, 1.296 and 1.277 respectively. Their standard deviation is very low which indicates that difference in responses of the respondent is not much.

**Table 2: Correlations Metrix**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>enac</th>
<th>ened</th>
<th>teme</th>
<th>edco</th>
<th>ece</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>enac</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ened</td>
<td>.914**</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teme</td>
<td>.920**</td>
<td>.827**</td>
<td>.857*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>edco</td>
<td>.904**</td>
<td>.946**</td>
<td>.898*</td>
<td>.959**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ece</td>
<td>.946**</td>
<td>.870**</td>
<td>.898*</td>
<td>.959**</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).**

Sources: SPSS 16.0 Output, 2018

The result from the correlation analysis as shown in table 2 indicates that there is positive and significant relationship between entrepreneurship actions (enac) and the influence of entrepreneurship education (ened); teaching methods (teme); educator’s competence (edco); and entrepreneurship curriculum contents (ece) on entrepreneurship actions (enac); but there is
not struggle correlation between the explanatory variables.

Table 3: Model summary of the study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Coefficients</th>
<th>Sig.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(Constant)</td>
<td>.405</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ened</td>
<td>.332</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>teme</td>
<td>.096</td>
<td>.158</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>edco</td>
<td>-.013</td>
<td>.816</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ece</td>
<td>.489</td>
<td>.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R</td>
<td>.965</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R²</td>
<td>.930</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted R²</td>
<td>.929</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-stat.</td>
<td>166.942</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F-sig</td>
<td>0.000</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D/W</td>
<td>1.824</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a. Predictors: (Constant), Curriculum Contents, Teaching methods in entrepreneurship, Entrepreneurship Education, Educator’s Competence

b. Dependent Variable: Entrepreneurship actions

Source: SPSS 16.0 Output, 2018

The cumulative correlation between dependent variable and all the independent variables is .930 indicating that the relationship between entrepreneurship actions (enac) and its determinant used in this study is 93% which is positively, strongly and statistically significant. The cumulative R² (.929) which is the multiple coefficient of determination gives the proportion or percentage of the total variation in the dependent variable explained by the independent variable jointly. Hence, it signifies that 92.9 percent of the total variation in entrepreneurship actions (enac) was caused by the entrepreneurship education (ened); teaching methods (teme); educator’s competence (edco); and entrepreneurship curriculum contents (ece). This shows that the model is fit and the explanatory variables are properly selected, combined and used. This can be confirmed by the value of F-statistics of 166.942 significant at 1% level of significance. The Durbin – Watson value of 1.824 indicates that errors are uncorrelated to each other indicating absence of serial correlation within the period of the study.

Test of hypotheses

The hypotheses of the study are tested as follows:
H₀₁: there is no significant relationship between entrepreneurship education and entrepreneurship actions. The result in table 3 shows the relationship between entrepreneurship education (ened) and entrepreneurship actions (enac) among NCE students in Federal College of Education (Technical), Gusau, Zamfara State. With p<0.05, we accepted the alternative hypothesis. Thus, there is significant positive relationship between entrepreneurship education and entrepreneurship actions (enac). The results confirmed the findings of [18].

H₀₂: there is no significant relationship between teaching methods in entrepreneurship and entrepreneurship actions. The result in table 3 shows the relationship between teaching methods (teme) and entrepreneurship actions (enac) among NCE students in Federal College of Education (Technical), Gusau, Zamfara State. With p>0.05, we accepted the null hypothesis. Thus, there is no significant relationship between teaching methods (teme) and entrepreneurship actions (enac). The results confirm the findings of [2] that there are low levels of business start-up activities among students during enterprise education and one year after graduation.

H₀₃: there is no significant relationship between educator’s competence and entrepreneurship actions. The result in table 3 shows the relationship between educator’s competence (edco) and entrepreneurship actions (enac) among NCE students in Federal College of Education (Technical), Gusau, Zamfara State. With p>0.05, we accepted the null hypothesis. Thus, there is no significant relationship between educator’s competence (edco) and entrepreneurship actions (enac). This is contrary to the finding of [19], [14], [20].
H$_{04}$: there is no significant relationship between entrepreneurship curriculum contents and entrepreneurship actions.

The result in table 3 shows the relationship between entrepreneurship curriculum contents (ece) and entrepreneurship actions (enac) among NCE students in Federal College of Education (Technical), Gusau, Zamfara State. With p<0.05, we accepted the alternative hypothesis. Thus, there is significant positive relationship between entrepreneurship curriculum contents (ece) and entrepreneurship actions (enac). The results confirmed the findings of [20] that there exists a positive correlation between Entrepreneurship Curriculum Contents (ece) and Entrepreneurship Actions (enac). This shows a good degree of dependency of entrepreneurship curriculum contents on entrepreneurship actions (enac) among NCE students in Federal College of Education in Nigeria.

**Conclusion**

Based on the findings of the study, the study concludes as follows:

1. Entrepreneurship education has a strong positive and statistically significant influence on entrepreneurship actions in Federal College of Education (Technical) Gusau, Zamfara state.

2. Teaching methods in entrepreneurship has no significant influence on entrepreneurship actions in Federal College of Education (Technical) Gusau, Zamfara state.

3. Educator’s competence has no significant influence on entrepreneurship actions in Federal College of Education (Technical) Gusau, Zamfara state.

4. Entrepreneurship actions and entrepreneurship curriculum contents have a strong positive and
statistically significant influence on entrepreneurship actions in Federal College of Education (Technical) Gusau, Zamfara state.

Recommendations

For the aforementioned finding, the following recommendations become important:

i. The stakeholders should ensure adequate entrepreneurship education in Nigeria tertiary institutions to inculcate entrepreneurship actions in graduates across Nigeria.

ii. The entrepreneurship educators across Nigeria tertiary institution should try use appropriate teaching in teaching entrepreneurship education as this will helps the students to generation entrepreneurship actions in a good time.

iii. Management of the Nigeria tertiary institutions should endeavour to involve the entrepreneurship educator that is competent enough to inculcate the required knowledge and skill that is needed by students to develop entrepreneurship actions.

iv. The entrepreneurship curriculum contents should be maintained or improve upon by the stakeholders to help in ensuring that the objectives of including entrepreneurship education in Nigeria tertiary institutions curriculum is achieved.
References


